



DULBECCO TELETHON INSTITUTE

CAREER AWARD PROGRAM

GUIDELINES FOR EXTERNAL REVIEWERS - 2015

The mission of Fondazione Telethon is to advance excellent research in Italy towards the cure of human genetic diseases. To this end, Telethon funds Career Awards to outstanding scientists wishing to establish their independent laboratory in a public or private non-profit Italian research institution.

The successful Candidates will join the **Dulbecco Telethon Institute (DTI)**, a virtual institute whose members are given the title of “Telethon Scientists”. These talented scientists work on a broad range of topics and in different Italian Institutions but share the same principles of rigour and excellence in the pursuit of scientific research aimed at understanding, preventing and curing genetic diseases.

The list of the active Telethon Scientists is accessible on the Telethon website at <http://dti.telethon.it/dti-labs>

In the 2015 call, **two Assistant Telethon Scientist** position is of **610,000 Euro** over five years according to the following funding scheme:

- annual **salary** of 40,000 Euro for the first three years and 45,000 Euro for the remaining two years
- **research grant** of 70,000 Euro/year
- **overhead** to the Host Institution of 5,000 Euro/ year
- **start-up grant** of 25,000 Euro.

REVIEWERS' ROLES

Your review will be made available to the Telethon Scientific Committee members to support them in the evaluation process.

Written comments are an essential part of your review and are critical in developing summary statements for the applicants.

Your individual criticisms will be directly and anonymously incorporated into a summary statement that will be fed back to the applicant. It is therefore important that your written material is accurate, clearly written, and does not include derogatory language.

EVALUATION FORM GUIDELINES

Comments on Applicant (max 2,000 characters including spaces)

Assess the intellectual ownership of the proposed research and the potential of the Applicant to develop into a completely independent scientist. Consider his/her training and publication record as well as the drive and motivation to succeed in establishing his/her own laboratory and mentoring junior staff.

Fondazione Telethon does not apply assessment of Candidate's CVs based on journal-based metrics, such as Journal Impact Factors. The Fondazione has signed and endorses the San Francisco Declaration on Research Assessment (DORA, <http://am.ascb.org/dora/>).

Comment on Research proposal

Description (max 2,000 characters including spaces)

Summarise the specific aims of the study and the hypothesis to be tested. Concisely describe the objectives and procedures of the proposed research. Do not make evaluation statements in this section.

Critique (max 12,000 characters including spaces)

This section should present a comprehensive evaluation of the application in narrative form. Please do not repeat the project description; only evaluation statements should be included. Provide an analysis of the **strengths** and **weaknesses** of the proposed research.

In your critique of the proposal, please individually assess the two aspects listed below:

1) Scientific Merit (max 10,000 characters including spaces): evaluate the overall scientific merit of the proposal on the basis of the following parameters:

- **Significance:** Does this study address an important problem? If the aims of the application are achieved, how will scientific knowledge be advanced? What will the effect of these studies be on the concepts or methods that drive this field?
- **Originality of science:** Does the project employ novel concepts, approaches or methods? Are the aims original and innovative? Does the project challenge existing paradigms or develop new methodologies or technologies?
- **Appropriateness of design and methods:** Are the conceptual framework, design, methods, and analyses adequately developed, well-integrated, and appropriate to the aims of the project?
- **Preliminary results:** Are proof-of-principle experiments provided, adequately supporting new principles to be tested in the grant? Are novel tools or reagents well-characterized?
- **Feasibility/safety:** Does the applicant acknowledge potential problem areas and consider alternative tactics? Please also evaluate the adequacy of the proposed protection for humans, animals or the environment, to the extent they may be adversely affected by the project proposed in the application (if any).
- **Link to the genetic disease:** what is the potential of the proposed project to unravel/clarify the pathophysiological mechanism of the disease(s) of interest or to develop a therapeutic approach specific to the disease(s) of interest?

2) Impact on patients (how close to therapeutic development or to any other potential impact on patients are the proposed studies?)

Overall evaluation (max 2,100 characters including spaces)

Please provide the **key reasons** for your overall recommendation (see below) indicating the relative **strengths**, **weaknesses** and **final considerations** in the specific fields.

Overall recommendation

On the basis of the specific points raised in your critique, please choose your recommendation as follows:

A - Strongly recommended; no substantial points need discussion

B - Recommended; minor points need discussion

C - Revision recommended; a small number of specific major points need to be addressed

D - Major revision necessary; multiple or fundamental problems can be addressed in a major revision

E - Revision not recommended; multiple or fundamental problems that will be difficult to address in a revision



THE ONLINE FORMATTING EDITOR

A text-formatting editor is available only in the specific fields inside the online form where “click to edit” is shown.

The main editor’s functions are the following:

1. Copying and pasting text from Microsoft Word while retaining text formatting as well as tables
2. Easy formatting of entered text with standard intuitive buttons
3. Typing special characters including all Greek letters

Formatting editor instructions

1. **The formatting editor allows the user to copy and paste text from Microsoft Word while retaining text formatting, with the following restrictions:**
 - a. You must use Microsoft Word to retain text formatting when copying and pasting: the use of other document editing software is not supported and could lead to errors in our online system
 - b. In order to fully retain the original formatting in Word, use the button  [Paste from Word], to copy text into the online field
 - c. Once text is pasted from Word, the default font will be automatically set to Arial with minimum size of 16 pt (corresponding to Arial 11 when printed). Please verify in the PDF output all text is clearly readable.
2. Hovering the mouse over the editor buttons will display a tooltip indicating their functions
3. Please note that the font Symbol (Greek characters) is not supported: you should use the “***Insert Special Character***” button  in the formatting editor.

To verify that the correct text formatting **has been applied please check the PDF of the Application by clicking on the “Download PDF” button.**

The Application PDF is always available while filling in the online Application; it is automatically generated every time the “Download PDF” button is clicked.